

## Kitab-based learning and the struggle for educational equality in Contemporary Indonesia: The case of Tafsir al-Jalalayn pedagogy

---

From: ervan nurtawab (ervan\_nur@yahoo.com)

To: studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id

Date: Tuesday, March 26, 2019, 9:33 AM GMT+7

---

Dear Studia Islamika

Hopefully, this letter finds you well. I write this letter in connection to my intention to submit my article draft entitled "Kitab-based Learning and the Struggle for Educational Equality in Contemporary Indonesia: The Case of Tafsir al-Jalalayn Pedagogy" to be submitted in Studia Islamika. I will let you find it attached in this email.

This paper is previously part of my PhD thesis submitted to Monash University in 2018, entitled "Jalalayn Pedagogical Practice: Styles of Qur'an and Tafsir Learning in Contemporary Indonesia."

It is my honour to have my work published in your journal. I highly appreciate your suggestion and advice in this regard.

I thank you very much for kindly attention, and I look very much forward to hearing back from you.

Kind regards,

Ervan Nurtawab  
Lecturer of Islamic Studies  
State Islamic University (IAIN) Metro Lampung

Ph.D. Anthropology, Monash University  
M.A. Islamic Studies, UIN Syarif Hidayatullah

Ph.D. research title: "Jalalayn Pedagogical Practice: Styles of Qur'an and Tafsir Learning in Contemporary Indonesia."



19 3 22\_Nurtawab\_Kitab-based learning n Struggle for equality.docx  
81.2kB

## [SDI] Submission Acknowledgement

---

From: Azyumardi Azra (journal@uinjkt.ac.id)

To: ervan\_nur@yahoo.com

Date: Thursday, March 28, 2019, 3:51 PM GMT+7

---

Ervan Nurtawab:

Thank you for submitting the manuscript, "Kitab-Based Learning and the Struggle for Educational Equality in Contemporary Indonesia: The Case of Tafsir al-Jalalayn Pedagogy" to Studia Islamika. With the online journal management system that we are using, you will be able to track its progress through the editorial process by logging in to the journal web site:

Manuscript URL:

<http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika/author/submission/11026>

Username: enurtawab

If you have any questions, please contact me. Thank you for considering this journal as a venue for your work.

Azyumardi Azra  
Studia Islamika

## Editor Decision

---

From: Studia Islamika UIN Syarif Hidayatullah (studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id)

To: ervan\_nur@yahoo.com

Date: Wednesday, July 17, 2019, 06:46 PM GMT+7

---

Dear Ervan Nurtawab,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Studia Islamika, "Kitab-Based Learning and the Struggle for Educational Equality in Contemporary Indonesia: The Case of Tafsir al-Jalalayn Pedagogy".

Please revise your article by following the comments as shown at the end of this email and also as appeared in the attached file.

We kindly hope that you will be able to submit your revision by September 17, 2019. If you find that this date is not feasible, please let us know as soon as possible.

Best,

Muhammad Nida' Fadlan  
Assistant to the Editors

-----  
Reviewer A:

### ORIGINALITY

Notwithstanding spectacular growth of formal modern classroom schooling in Indonesia since the 1870s, the traditional method of the Islamic boarding school or pesantren has continued, although its results more and more are seen as supporting private piety and not as a preparation for a career in society. This article mentions two decrees in 2014 by the Ministry of Religion which attempt a reorganization and reevaluation of this type of religious education. Considered against the background of the 'turn towards the conservative' in Indonesian Islam (usually described as an affiliation to Salafi Islam from the modern Arab world), this is a relevant and important description of a widespread element in contemporary Islam in the country. This is done by two modern cases: the use of Tafsir al-Jalalayn among 'modernist/reformist' Persis organization and the activities of Syaikh al-Makki in Sukabumi since the 1980s.

### THE DEPTH OF LITERATURES

For the older history of teaching in pesantren the proper literature is used: Mahmud Junus, Zamakhshari Dhofier, Steenbrink, Azra. However, the work by Mahmud Junus was not written as a Ph.D. thesis, and not published in 1979 but in 1960 (at that time his name spelled as Junus). My copy of 1960 has the spelling Junus instead of written Yunus. Page 6

The Ph.D. thesis of Steenbrink is not of 1980 but 1974, also page 6. The Indonesian translation is indeed of 1986.

Zamakhshari Dhofier published his book on pesantren first in 1982, while our author apparently used a later edition. Several of these references should be corrected.

The two decisions of the Minister of Religion are not properly indicated, and there is no indication of further reactions: what has happened with these decrees of 2014? We are now 5 years later. The author writes has outspoken criticism towards these measures, but no further sources:

Page 22: "Colleagues in the pesantren environment told me that such a project will be extremely difficult to implement on the grounds that titles such as kyai or mama or ajengan are not the product of professional training or courses. Rather, social acceptance of a teacher is based on their charisma and genealogy, as well as their expertise in Islamic knowledge as a noted teacher among members of a Muslim community. My colleagues also critiqued the testing process, which is open to manipulation by applicants keen to obtain recognition. Further, there have been suggestions

that the kyai should be appointed as civil servants. These policy measures indicate a reversion of the marginalisation process that has affected kitab-based learning for a long time.”

I found the text of one decree easily as <http://ditjenpp.kemenkumham.go.id/arsip/bn/2014/bn972-2014.pdf>

But no speculation about follow up: SDA or Suryadharma Ali signed the law. Soon afterwards he was followed by Lukman Hakim Saifuddin, even more stronger someone from a pesantren environment. But a quick scan on sites of Nahdlatul Ulama as well as Departemen Agama shows that there is a continuing decline in the use of kitab kuning. In 2016 Minister Lukman Hakim handed over a certificate to Pondok Pesantren Gontor (at the occasion of its 90th anniversary since 1926). But Gontor has also its own policy (a classroom system, Egyptian booklets from secular secondary schools, and not really a fan of Jalalayn!)

## FINDINGS PRESENTATION

There are quite contrasting conclusions: from one side we read that this decisions of 2014, the use of Jalalayn in Persis and the work by al-Makki may lead to a ‘reversion of the marginalisation process’ (page 22), but this is heavily under criticism as to these decisions as well. The two examples of Persis and al-Makki are too weak to show a clear process overall in Indonesia. Besides, it is, as to Al-Makki also made clear that the bandongan way of learning Islam is only a part-time business for the students who in most cases follow a modern classroom-type formal education elsewhere.

This makes the impact much more modest than sometimes suggested by the author.

## IMPLICATIONS FOR UNDERSTANDING ISLAM IN INDONESIA AND SOUTHEAST ASIA

There is much written about the upcoming propaganda for radical, salafi Islam, also attention is given often to the continuation of reformism and liberal Islam, but little to the continuation of this type of traditional Islamic teaching and therefore this article seems useful and important.

The claim of a ‘true educational equality’ is expressed here and put in a very modest climate.

Bob Hefner wrote some time ago an interesting article: ‘Where have all the abangan gone?’ (2011, in a book published by Michel Picard and Rémy Madinier. This could be the equivalent of that article: ‘Where have all the santri gone?’ Well, they are still present, memorizing long texts, reading kitab kuning, but they are not so visible anymore! This is the reason why this article with some corrections and emendations is good material.

## TECHNICAL WRITING

The word bandongan is not in the Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia and not in the Javanese dictionaries. As far as I know it is Sundanese. It may have the meaning (as bandungan) of two types together. Or in Sundanese of a gamelan with several melodies. Could the term be explained somewhat more?

Kitab loghatan (page 4) is also new to me. I know the way of printing an Arab text with Malay or Javanese translation as kitab jenggot, (‘beard book’) because the translation is printed below each word.

Jalalayn is in the title and also on various places in the book, but why is exactly this taken as the symbol for the sign of an educational equality, is not explained. It is also stated that only in the higher levels of this type of education the difficult study of Qur’an interpretation or tafsir is put in the centre.

It takes much time before the author comes to his real topic: until page 9 (one-third of the whole article) only the colonial period is discussed. The two decisions of 2014 are only debated on pages 21-2. Ahmad Makki 22-25.

Why is Baljon mentioned for modern tafsir in India and not Jomier and Janssen for modern Egypt? (page 10)

KNIP (page 18) may be unclear for non-Indonesian readers as the not-chosen, but nominated first or preparatory parliament of the Indonesian Republic 1945-1955 (until the first true elections)

-----  
--  
=====

**STUDIA ISLAMIKA (ISSN 0215-0492; E-ISSN 2355-6145)**

is an international journal published by the [Center for Study of Islam and Society \(PPIM\) UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta](#). It specializes in Indonesian Islamic Studies in particular, and South-east Asian Islamic Studies in general.

***Editorial Office:***

**Gedung Pusat Pengkajian Islam dan Masyarakat (PPIM) UIN Jakarta**

**Jl. Kertamukti No. 5, Pisangan Barat, Cirendeui,**

**Ciputat, 15419, Jakarta, Indonesia**

**Phone: (62-21) 7423543, 7499272, Fax: (62-21) 7408633**

**Email: [studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id](mailto:studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id)**

**Website: <http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika>**



Article\_Kitab-Based Learning.docx  
85.8kB

## Re: [SDI] Editor Decision

---

From: ervan nurtawab (ervan\_nur@yahoo.com)

To: journal@uinjkt.ac.id

Date: Tuesday, September 17, 2019, 05:02 PM GMT+7

---

Dear the Editors of the Studia Islamika Journal

Hopefully this letter finds you well. By this letter, I'd like to inform you that I have finished making necessary changes and revisions based on the anonymous reviewers' suggestions. I will let you find the revised draft attached in this email.

I express grateful thanks to all the suggestions, and that it's my honour to have my work published in your journal.

That's all and I look very much forward to hearing back from you.

Kind regards  
Ervan Nurtawab

---

### **Ervan Nurtawab**

Lecturer of Qur'anic studies, State Institute of Islamic Studies (*Institut Agama Islam Negeri*, IAIN)  
Metro, Lampung-Indonesia

- Ph.D. in Anthropology, Monash University (Research title: *Jalalayn* pedagogical practices: Styles on Qur'an and *tafsir* learning in contemporary Indonesia).
- Magister and Bachelor in Islamic Studies, State Islamic University (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta

### Latest publication:

"The Malay *Tafsir* in the Sheik Muhammad Said Collection in Marawi City, Lanao del Sur, Philippines." In O. Fathurahman, M. Kawashima, and L. S. Riwarung (eds.). *The Library of an Islamic Scholar of Mindanao: The Collection of Sheik Muhammad Said bin Imam sa Bayang at the Al-Imam As-Saddiq (A.S.) Library, Marawi City, Philippines: An Annotated Catalogue with Essays*. (Occasional Papers, No. 27). Tokyo: Institute of Asian, African, and Middle Eastern Studies (IAAMES) of Sophia University. 2019. (@2019 IAAMES, Sophia University. All rights reserved.)

On Wednesday, July 17, 2019, 06:46:48 PM GMT+7, Azyumardi Azra <journal@uinjkt.ac.id> wrote:

Dear Ervan Nurtawab,

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Studia Islamika, "Kitab-Based Learning and the Struggle for Educational Equality in Contemporary Indonesia: The Case of Tafsir al-Jalalayn Pedagogy".

Please revise your article by following the comments as shown at the end of this email and also as appeared in the attached file.

We kindly hope that you will be able to submit your revision by September 17, 2019. If you find that this date is not feasible, please let us know as soon as possible.

Best,

Muhammad Nida' Fadlan  
Assistant to the Editors

---

Reviewer A:

#### ORIGINALITY

Notwithstanding spectacular growth of formal modern classroom schooling in Indonesia since the 1870s, the traditional method of the Islamic boarding school or pesantren has continued, although its results more and more are seen as supporting private piety and not as a preparation for a career in society. This article mentions two decrees in 2014 by the Ministry of Religion which attempt a reorganization and reevaluation of this type of religious education. Considered against the background of the 'turn towards the conservative' in Indonesian Islam (usually described as an affiliation to Salafi Islam from the modern Arab world), this is a relevant and important description of a widespread element in contemporary Islam in the country. This is done by two modern cases: the use of Tafsir al-Jalalayn among 'modernist/reformist' Persis organization and the activities of Syaikh al-Makki in Sukabumi since the 1980s.

#### THE DEPTH OF LITERATURES

For the older history of teaching in pesantren the proper literature is used: Mahmud Junus, Zamakhshari Dhofier, Steenbrink, Azra. However, the work by Mahmud Junus was not written as a Ph.D. thesis, and not published in 1979 but in 1960 (at that time his name spelled as Junus). My copy of 1960 has the spelling Junus instead of written Yunus. Page 6

The Ph.D. thesis of Steenbrink is no of 1980 but 1974, also page 6. The Indonesian translation is indeed of 1986.

Zamakhshari Dhofier published his book on pesantren first in 1982, while our author apparently used a later edition. Several of these references should be corrected.

The two decisions of the Minister of Religion are not properly indicated, and there is no indication of further reactions: what has happened with these decrees of 2014? We are now 5 years later. The author writes has outspoken criticism towards these measures, but no further sources:

Page 22: "Colleagues in the pesantren environment told me that such a project will be extremely difficult to implement on the grounds that titles such as kyai or mama or ajengan are not the product of professional training or courses. Rather, social acceptance of a teacher is based on their charisma and genealogy, as well as their expertise in Islamic knowledge as a noted teacher among members of a Muslim community. My colleagues also critiqued the testing process, which is open to manipulation by applicants keen to obtain recognition. Further, there have been suggestions that the kyai should be appointed as civil servants. These policy measures indicate a reversion of the marginalisation process that has affected kitab-based learning for a long time."

I found the text of one decree easily as

<http://ditjenpp.kemenkumham.go.id/arsip/bn/2014/bn972-2014.pdf>

But no speculation about follow up: SDA or Suryadharma Ali signed the law. Soon afterwards he was followed by Lukman Hakim Saifuddin, even more stronger someone from a pesantren environment. But a quick scan on sites of Nahdlatul Ulama as well as Departemen Agama shows that there is a continuing decline in the use of kitab kuning. In 2016 Minister Lukman Hakim handed over a certificate to Pondok Pesantren Gontor (at the occasion of its 90th anniversary since 1926). But Gontor has also its own policy (a classroom system, Egyptian booklets from secular secondary schools, and not really a fan of Jalalayn!)

## FINDINGS PRESENTATION

There are quite contrasting conclusions: from one side we read that this decisions of 2014, the use of Jalalayn in Persis and the work by al-Makki may lead to a 'reversion of the marginalisation process' (page 22), but this is heavily under criticism as to these decisions as well. The two examples of Persis and al-Makki are too weak to show a clear process overall in Indonesia. Besides, it is, as to Al-Makki also made clear that the bandongan way of learning Islam is only a part-time business for the students who in most cases follow a modern classroom-type formal education elsewhere.

This makes the impact much more modest than sometimes suggested by the author.

## IMPLICATIONS FOR UNDERSTANDING ISLAM IN INDONESIA AND SOUTHEAST ASIA

There is much written about the upcoming propaganda for radical, salafi Islam, also attention is given often to the continuation of reformism and liberal Islam, but little to the continuation of this type of traditional Islamic teaching and therefore this article seems useful and important.

The claim of a 'true educational equality' is expressed here and put in a very modest climate.

Bob Hefner wrote some time ago an interesting article: 'Where have all the abangan gone?' (2011, in a book published by Michel Picard and Rémy Madinier. This could be the equivalent of that article: 'Where have all the santri gone?' Well, they are still present, memorizing long texts, reading kitab kuning, but they are not so visible anymore! This is the reason why this article with some corrections and emendations is good material.

## TECHNICAL WRITING

The word bandongan is not in the Kamus Besar Bahasa Indonesia and not in the Javanese dictionaries. As far as I know it is Sundanese. It may have the meaning (as bandungan) of two types together. Or in Sundanese of a gamelan with several melodies. Could the term be explained somewhat more?

Kitab loghatan (page 4) is also new to me. I know the way of printing an Arab text with Malay or Javanese translation as kitab jenggot, ('beard book') because the translation is printed below each word.

Jalalayn is in the title and also on various places in the book, but why is exactly this taken as the symbol for the sign of an educational equality, is not explained. It is also stated that only in the higher levels of this type of education the difficult study of Qur'an interpretation or tafsir is put in the centre.

It takes much time before the author comes to his real topic: until page 9 (one-third of the whole article) only the colonial period is discussed. The two decisions of 2014 are only debated on pages 21-2. Ahmad Makki 22-25.

Why is Baljon mentioned for modern tafsir in India and not Jomier and Janssen for modern Egypt? (page 10)

KNIP (page 18) may be unclear for non-Indonesian readers as the not-chosen, but nominated first or preparatory parliament of the Indonesian Republic 1945-1955 (until the first true elections)





19 9 17\_Article\_Kitab-Based Learning.docx  
98kB

## [SDI] Editor Decision

---

From: Azyumardi Azra (journal@uinjkt.ac.id)

To: ervan\_nur@yahoo.com

Date: Wednesday, September 25, 2019, 09:18 AM GMT+7

---

Dear Ervan Nurtawab,

We hope this email finds you well.

We have reached a decision regarding your submission to Studia Islamika, "Kitab-Based Learning and the Struggle for Educational Equality in Contemporary Indonesia: The Case of Tafsir al-Jalalayn Pedagogy".

Our decision is to consider your article to publish in the next publication of our Studia Islamika.

Please do keep pay attention to our information during this publication process.

Sincerely yours,

Azyumardi Azra

(SCOPUS ID: 55854422100; h-index: 3); Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University of Jakarta, [INDONESIAstudia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id](mailto:INDONESIAstudia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id)  
Editor-In-Chief Studia Islamika (P-ISSN: 0215-0492; E-ISSN: 2355-6145) Center for the Study of Islam and Society (PPIM) Syarif Hidayatullah State Islamic University of Jakarta, INDONESIA

## Re: Title Change

---

From: ervan nurtawab (ervan\_nur@yahoo.com)

To: studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id

Date: Wednesday, December 11, 2019, 08:44 PM GMT+7

---

Dear The Studia Islamika Journal Editorial Board

Many thanks for your email. I am so delighted to hear that my paper will get published in your journal soon.

I thank you very much for suggesting a changing in the title of my published article version.

I think, the suggested title is very good, and very powerful as well. I agree with that and let you continue with the publication.

really looking forward to it.

All best wishes

Ervan

---

### **Ervan Nurtawab**

Lecturer of Qur'anic studies, State Institute of Islamic Studies (*Institut Agama Islam Negeri*, IAIN) Metro, Lampung-Indonesia

- Ph.D. in Anthropology, Monash University (Research title: *Jalalayn* pedagogical practices: Styles on Qur'an and *tafsir* learning in contemporary Indonesia.
- Magister and Bachelor in Islamic Studies, State Islamic University (UIN) Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta

Latest publication:

“The Malay *Tafsir* in the Sheik Muhammad Said Collection in Marawi City, Lanao del Sur, Philippines.” In O. Fathurahman, M. Kawashima, and L. S. Riwarung (eds.). *The Library of an Islamic Scholar of Mindanao: The Collection of Sheik Muhammad Said bin Imam sa Bayang at the Al-Imam As-Saddiq (A.S.) Library, Marawi City, Philippines: An Annotated Catalogue with Essays*. (Occasional Papers, No. 27). Tokyo: Institute of Asian, African, and Middle Eastern Studies (IAAMES) of Sophia University. 2019. (@2019 IAAMES, Sophia University. All rights reserved.)

---

On Wednesday, December 11, 2019, 09:35:44 AM GMT+7, Studia Islamika UIN Syarif Hidayatullah <studia.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id> wrote:

Dear Pak Ervan,

We would like to inform you that we are preparing your article to be published online in Vol. 26, No. 3, 2019. It is scheduled to be available this month.

However, we recommend changing the title of your article to **"The Decline of Traditional Learning Methods in Changing Indonesia: Trends of *Bandongan-Kitāb* Readings in *Pesantrens*"**. We kindly hope that you will be able to give your feedback by December 13, 2019. If you find that this date is not feasible, please let us know as soon as possible.

Best,

Muhammad Nida Fadlan  
Assistant to the Editors

--

=====

**STUDIA ISLAMIKA (ISSN 0215-0492; E-ISSN 2355-6145)**

is an international journal published by the [Center for Study of Islam and Society \(PPIM\) UIN Syarif Hidayatullah Jakarta](#). It specializes in Indonesian Islamic Studies in particular, and South-east Asian Islamic Studies in general.

***Editorial Office:***

**Gedung Pusat Pengkajian Islam dan Masyarakat (PPIM) UIN Jakarta**

**Jl. Kertamukti No. 5, Pisangan Barat, Cirendeu,**

**Ciputat, 15419, Jakarta, Indonesia**

**Phone: (62-21) 7423543, 7499272, Fax: (62-21) 7408633**

**Email: [studies.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id](mailto:studies.islamika@uinjkt.ac.id)**

**Website: <http://journal.uinjkt.ac.id/index.php/studia-islamika>**